Less than half of parents of children with special needs surveyed felt their kids in preschools were adequately supported by teachers, curriculum & facilities

Part Two of Lien Foundation’s Inclusive Attitudes survey polled parents of children with special needs for their views on inclusion with regard to children with special needs and education. Less than a third (28%) of them saw Singapore as an inclusive society.

The majority (77%) support inclusive education† & only more than half of them felt their service needs in transportation (58%), medical and dental (55%) & childcare (54%) were being met.

4 July 2016

1. While parents of children with special needs did not differ much from the public (30%) in their perception of Singapore as an inclusive society, they voiced their desire for greater support from the government, society and education system. This comes at a time when the next Enabling Masterplan is being deliberated to set policies, programmes, services and support for people with disabilities in Singapore.

2. Commissioned by the Lien Foundation and conducted by Blackbox Research with the assistance of 20 Special Education (SPED) schools and EIPIC Centres, Part Two of the Inclusive Attitudes Survey offer insights into the challenges faced by parents of children with special needs and their views on how to make Singapore more inclusive. From January to May 2016, 835 parents with children with special needs of age 9 years and below were polled.

3. The results of Part 1 and 2 of the survey highlight the urgency to move Singapore from tolerance to greater acceptance, and active inclusion of children with special needs and their families. To achieve this, we need greater public education and awareness of this issue, a

---

† Inclusive education in the survey is defined as an approach to education where:
- All children are valued equally and have equal opportunities to participate meaningfully in class activities, regardless of their needs;
- The culture, curriculum and environment of the school responses to the diversity of children’s needs, with the best interests of the child as the primary consideration. Dignity and the freedom to make one’s choices during the learning process are valued over convenience and speed;
- Inclusion in school is recognised as an important aspect of greater inclusion in society.
stronger system of support for children with special needs and their families across different levels of our society, and laws that protect and advance the interest of children with special needs.

**Obligations & Aspirations**

4. In 2013, Singapore ratified the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities⁷, where Article 24 (United Nations, 2006) guarantees the right of persons with disabilities to an inclusive education system at all levels. Signatory countries commit to providing “effective individualized support measures in environments that maximize academic and social development, consistent with the goal of full inclusion”. Presently, there is no statutory support ensuring children with special needs have access to an inclusive education at all levels.

5. “To fulfill national obligations and parental aspirations, our society needs to work together to prevent segregation and promote inclusion within the education system,” said Mr Lee Poh Wah, CEO of Lien Foundation. “The challenge is making participation possible for all, with a competent education system meeting the needs of all children, offering real choices and confidence to parents.” He added, “The road to inclusion continues to be work in progress, for we need to confront any biases holding us back. An inclusive Singapore is where all children, including those with special needs, have the opportunity to realise their potential, and so affirms the national vision of providing A Good Start for Every Child³.” In this survey, parents of children with special needs give voice to the gaps and opportunities in our journey to inclusion.

**Parents report inadequate support in preschools**

6. About half of the parents surveyed had children studying in preschools. 46% of these parents encountered difficulties when enrolling their children in preschools. More than half of them (54%) observed that schools were unwilling to take their child because of their special needs, and about half (54%) encountered inexperienced or untrained teachers / staff. More than a third (37%) indicated that the school had no access to professionals to support their child.

“Finding a kindergarten for a special needs child … Long waiting time and hostile assessment by the kindergartens are often experienced with no chance of getting an enrolment at all” - Survey Respondent

7. More needs to be done to improve preschool education for children with special needs. Of those parents whose children with special needs were in preschools, just about half (55%) were

---


satisfied with their child’s education. Less than half of these parents felt their kids in preschools were adequately supported by the teachers, curriculum and school facilities.

8. They shared concerns about the adequacy of the teachers. Less than half (46%) agree that the teachers provide their child with the needed attention, and just about a third (34%) felt that the teachers in preschools are sufficiently trained to support their child’s needs.

“MOE schools are not ready to accept these children into the system. Teachers are not trained and tend to treat these children as troublesome. Not enough support is being given to the teachers to support the children. Even AEDs (Allied Educators) are not adequately trained. Parents are generally worried about the transition from K2 to P1. Pathlight (long waiting queue) or mainstream (will the child be ostracised?) or deferment (till when)? Too many uncertainties for Special Needs Children.” - Survey Respondent

9. Only 32% of parents whose children are in preschools think that the curriculum offered by preschools is suitable for children with special needs. One out of three parents (33%) indicated that preschools are equipped with the right facilities to meet their children’s needs.

Separated by education

10. The parents’ feedback on inadequate support in preschools underscores how the current system is skewed towards the mainstream. This could also explain why 77% of parents polled support the idea of inclusive education. An inclusive education is designed to cater the needs of children with special needs, as well as those of typically developing children. Presently, a chasm exists between these two groups of children as intervention programmes are largely separated from education. Today, an estimated 2,600 children with moderate and severe special needs receive intervention at EIPIC centres. It is estimated that about 1,800 or 70% of them do not attend preschool due to the severity of their needs and the lack of readiness of preschools.

11. “We need to equip early childhood educators with deeper and broader knowledge of children with special needs - how they can be engaged and learn best,” said Ms Sally Kwek, a parent of a child with special needs and Founding Editor, Special Seeds. “Our current system tends to keep such know-how within the special education and allied health specialists. To stop this trend and improve inclusion, all early childhood personnel should be armed with such training.”

Gap in key services

12. Besides the need for a robust system of support in education, the survey indicated the weak physical infrastructure and environment faced by parents of children with special needs. Just about half of respondents felt their key service needs were being met - transportation (58%),
medical and dental (55%) and childcare (54%). The gap in key services compounds the many challenges faced these parents.

“(For) working parents with special needs child, there is no additional childcare leave for emergency. I need to know the place before I bring my child with special needs out because many spots do not let me to push a wheelchair around. Fees for special needs children’s education and transportation are expensive. If my child takes the school bus, I need to pay for two passengers as my helper is needed to assist him on the bus.” – Survey Respondent

**Multiple challenges from different fronts**

13. According to the survey, the burden of care of children with special needs falls mostly on mothers, with two in five families having a parent quit work to look after their child. Next to parents (61%), domestic helpers (16%) were cited as primary caregivers of children with special needs, followed by grandparents (13%).

14. Parents of children with special needs struggled to find information on what to do after their child’s diagnosis. Only slightly more than half of those surveyed were aware of who to contact and what to do about their questions and concerns. One in two parents were able to find and use available services and programmes.

15. The strains of caregiving show up in the parents’ responses to the question on their level of satisfaction with their relationships and life. Compared to the general public, their satisfaction level for relationships and life was 10% and 16% lower respectively. Finances were another key area of concern.

**Wish for greater financial support**

16. Despite increased subsidies for the EIPIC programme of $32 million in 2014 and public expenditure of $145 million on SPED Schools in 2015, 43% of the parents surveyed wished for more financial support from the government. Nearly 60% of respondents with household income of $7,000 to $9,900 felt this way.

“We parents of these special needs children would like to provide the same opportunities normal kids have. It is also unfortunate that once your kids are labeled as "special needs", things starts to get more expensive. E.g School fees for normal kids are heavily subsidized by MOE. But here I am paying hundreds of dollars a month to put them in special school. Swimming lessons for normal kids cost around $40-$50 a month but I pay $300 a month for a swimming instructor. And let’s not talk about school bus fees, therapy lessons etc ...
It is the group of parents with special needs children who need more financial assistance as most of the lessons, fees etc. are so expensive. So when parents cannot afford it, they will stop providing these to the special kids (who probably need it more than normal children).” – Survey Respondent

**Educating the public**

17. As parents of children with special needs try to cope with the system, they also juggle an emotional roller coaster socially. One in three parents polled have heard insensitive remarks being directed at their child by adults. Almost half of the children with special needs do not have typically developing friends.

“Special needs children are treated like ‘disease’ kids in situations I have seen personally. The public needs to be more aware and tolerant about such kids.” - Survey Respondent

“They do not know how to engage the special needs community. Start young by opening up the public sector schools to the special needs community. Teach the young how to engage this group.”- Survey Respondent

18. Public education efforts can improve understanding of children with special needs and their disabilities, teach adults and children how to relate and connect with children with special needs and promote interactions. With greater understanding and acceptance from society, children with special needs will be encouraged to expand their circle socially and in the community.

**Time outside classroom less than ideal**

19. According to the survey, four out of 10 parents of children with special needs think their children are spending too little time outside of school and in the community doing the things they like. The library, cinema and museum/place of attraction emerged as the least visited places on the list of public spaces frequented by children with special needs.

20. Close to half of the respondents (47%) cited difficulty in controlling their child as the reason for not being able to spend more time in public and community spaces. Other factors include having problems moving around (41%) and being judged if they are unable to control their child (31%), as well as cost (28%).

“Educate all service providers and families not to be judgmental about special needs patrons. They have feelings too.” - Survey Respondent

“If less people understand the kids and parents, we will be cooped up in our homes and have a phobia of going out due to the stares.” – Survey Respondent

21. Dr Kenneth Poon, Researcher and Clinical Psychologist observed, "What parents in this study have highlighted is consistent with the broader findings that parents who have more access to
the community also report less symptoms of psychological distress. They highlighted the need for 'hardware' which includes physical infrastructure such as ramps and the availability of accessible public transportation, 'software' or training of staff members of community spaces and of preschools, and 'heartware' which refer to the inclusive attitudes among the general public and professionals."

**Staying optimistic despite it all**

22. Despite the dangers of social isolation and multiple challenges faced, parents of children with special needs are more optimistic than the general public with regards to society’s interactions with their children. Joy, instead of fear, was amongst the dominant emotions noted by these parents when adults interact with their children. Compared to the general public (65%), less than a third (27%) of parents of children with special needs felt their children were at risk of bullying by other children.

**Rights to compulsory education**

23. However, the majority of parents of children with special needs (72%) think new laws are necessary to better promote the rights of children with special needs, and half of them are aware of the rights related to their child’s special needs.

24. Some parents in the survey suggested instituting laws to protect and advance the interests of children with special needs. For instance, compulsory education can protect those from disadvantaged or dysfunctional homes where parents are unable to help the child with special needs achieve his or her potential or functioning level.

> “So that special needs children will not be discriminated by society and treated equally just like any other child.” - Survey Respondent

**Laws to protect**

25. The urge for equality is an area where laws could make a difference. Presently, children with special needs in Singapore are exempted from compulsory education even though Singapore has ratified the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, which provides for inclusive education. The 2012-2016 Enabling Masterplan had called for the Ministry of Education to make education for children with special needs compulsory by 2016. This would

---


set a baseline of access to education for these children and ensure a commitment to their education needs. To date, there has yet to be any update on the recommendation.

26. “Singapore is an exception among the top PISA-ranked countries of Hong Kong, South Korea, Japan, Taiwan and Finland because unlike them, we have yet to introduce laws to support inclusion in education,” said Mr Lee. (see Annex A) “In their quest for excellence, these top performers seek to meet the needs of all children. We can do likewise - starting with change from within – by adopting new mindsets towards inclusion to achieve new possibilities.” AWWA’s Kindle Garden, Singapore’s first inclusive preschool, is an example of how inclusive education is making headway and gaining acceptance with parents of typically developing children and those with special needs.

**Inclusion: Access & opportunities for all**

27. However, the journey of inclusion has to continue into mainstream primary schools and especially transition into Primary One. The primary school curriculum is designed for typically developing children, so children with special needs have little choice but to fit into the structure. Rather than fit square pegs into round holes, an inclusive education can be more beneficial. Studies in both OECD and non-OECD countries indicated that students with disabilities achieve better school results in inclusive settings. In the U.S., it is estimated that 80-85% of children with special needs can meet the same standards as their typically developing peers if given the right support.

28. So if mainstream schools were to keep a mandatory number of places for children with special needs, this could effectively begin a process of active inclusion. Although mainstream education may not suit all children with special needs, the opportunity of compulsory access gives them equal chances for education that empower their life chances and boost their ability to participate more fully in the community. However, integration “should not be done at all costs”, according to the Disabled People’s Association (DPA). It believes that “in the future there can be an integrated education system in which special education schools are in some way included in the national education system, rather than existing somewhere in between that system and the voluntary welfare sector.”

29. The community must also be ready for inclusion. Greater public awareness and education about

---

9 http://www.cehd.umn.edu/nceo/onlinepubs/Martha_Thurlow-Meeting_the_Needs_of_Special_Education_Students.pdf
children with special needs can break through walls of discomfort to promote greater understanding. However, the support system and education for children with special needs must also gear up in capacity and capabilities and at various levels of society. For when these factors are combined with laws that protect and advance their interests, they will give each child a strong and good start regardless of their special needs.

Annex A - Inclusive Education: A Comparison
Annex B - Views & suggestions from parents surveyed

~00~

About the Lien Foundation

The Lien Foundation is a Singapore philanthropic house noted for its model of radical philanthropy. It breaks new ground by investing in innovative solutions, convening strategic partnerships and catalysing action on social and environmental challenges. The Foundation seeks to foster exemplary early childhood education, excellence in eldercare and effective environmental sustainability in water and sanitation. In the area of early childhood education, the Foundation aims to create a better playing field by strengthening capacity in this area and opening up opportunities for disadvantaged preschoolers.

To advocate greater access to quality early childhood education, the Foundation commissioned a study, Vital Voices for Vital Years, that examined leaders’ views on improving Singapore’s preschool sector. In June 2012, the Lien Foundation released a global benchmark study called Starting Well that ranked 45 countries on their provision of preschool education. The use of I.T forms a key strategy in the Foundation’s efforts to increase efficiencies and enhance professionalism in the preschool sector.

The Foundation championed a community-based model of care where specialists go into mainstream preschools to help children with learning difficulties. Its success has inspired a scaled-up national version in Singapore. In its push for inclusivity in education, the Foundation set up Singapore’s first inclusive preschool, Kindle Garden, with AWWA. To improve outcomes for disadvantaged preschoolers, the Foundation spearheaded Circle of Care, a child-centric model of care where teachers, social workers and therapists look after the children’s holistic development and the needs of their families in an integrated way.

Media contacts

Joanne Lee       Qeren Communications       joanne@qeren.biz       +65 9002 7696
Genevieve Kuek   Qeren Communications       gen@qeren.biz         +65 9763 3110
ANNEX A  INCLUSIVE EDUCATION – A COMPARISON

1 Inclusive Education in Singapore

There are currently 20 SPED schools in Singapore run by 13 Voluntary Welfare Organisations that receive funding from MOE and NCSS, and six private SPED schools. Children with special needs are currently exempted from compulsory education\(^1\). Intervention programmes are delivered separately from mainstream education.

In 2013, Singapore ratified the **UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (UNCRPD)** that “looks at what can be done to make sure that persons with disabilities can have access to rights as everybody else”\(^2\). Article 24 of the UNCRPD deals with the right to inclusive education and provides that children with disabilities should be able to participate in the general education system, and that children with disabilities should be educated in mainstream schools\(^3\).

Singapore’s **Enabling Masterplan 2012-2016** supported the principle of extending compulsory education to include children with special needs as the committee was of the view that compulsory education would “promote inclusiveness and ensure that resources are adequately available for children with special needs”. They recommended “implications of including children with special needs within the Compulsory Education Act be studied and addressed with the aim of including them under the Act by 2016.”\(^4\)

---

\(^1\) [https://www.moe.gov.sg/education/education-system/compulsory-education](https://www.moe.gov.sg/education/education-system/compulsory-education)


2 Inclusive Education: How does Singapore compare?

Some countries where inclusion is supported by legislation (listed by PISA 2012 ranking):

**Hong Kong**

PISA 2012 - #2

In Hong Kong, children aged six or above with special educational needs enjoy free and universal basic education. Currently about 80% of students with various types of special educational needs are studying in regular schools. In 2001, the Education Bureau established a Whole School Approach to Integrated Education (WSA) for the education of special needs children to fulfil its obligations under the United Nations Convention on Rights of the Child and the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities.

In 2008, the Bureau launched a five-year programme to train teachers and strengthen their capacity in catering for students with special educational needs (SEN) in regular schools. Children with more severe or multiple disabilities are placed in special schools for intensive support.

In 2011/12, all 460 public primary and 400 public secondary schools in Hong Kong were requested to adopt a whole-of-school-approach to support students with special educational needs, including those with mild intellectual, physical or sensory disabilities.

**South Korea**

PISA 2012 - #3

The Special Education Promotion Act (SEPA) in 1977 and its re-authorisation in 1997 laid the foundation for reforms in special education which placed students with disabilities in regular classrooms.

---

9 [https://repository.nie.edu.sg/bitstream/10497/13722/1/APJE-31-2-143_a.pdf](https://repository.nie.edu.sg/bitstream/10497/13722/1/APJE-31-2-143_a.pdf)
Statutory provisions regarding special education were enacted since 1979. All children from the age of six years are included in compulsory education. To support inclusive education, Japan started a programme to strengthen the support system in regular schools in 2005.

Since 2007, the Local Education Board is legally obliged to ask the parents’ opinion for the placement of children. Depending on the needs of the child, special needs education is provided both in special classes within mainstream schools and within regular classes. In more extreme cases, specialist "Schools for Special Needs Education" are available.

Taiwan has a comprehensive legal framework (e.g. Special Education Act, People with Disabilities Rights Protection Act) for the education of students with SEN that emphasise elimination of discrimination, early identification/intervention and appropriate education for students with SEN. An Individualised Education Plan (IEP) is compulsory for all SEN students. Each year, the Taiwan government allocates not less than 4.5% of its budgeted expenditure on education to special education.

There are statutes that guarantee everyone residing in Finland the right to free basic education. Basic education is also compulsory. The Finnish Education Act says that every student has a right to be supported in learning and in personal development, and that every student has a right to get special needs education and student welfare support if needed. Only less than 2% of children are studying in special schools for disabled children. According to the current legislation, teaching and support is done in mainstream education, except in cases where schooling in a separate group better supports the child’s development.

Australia
(PISA 2012 - #14)

The Disability Standards for Education 2005 outlines legal obligations for education under Australia’s national Disability Discrimination Act 1992 (DDA). These legal obligations include ensuring the right of every child who experiences disability to education on the same basis as any child not labelled disabled. A resource, titled ‘Planning for Personalised Learning and Support: A National Resource’ was created to support the Disability Standards for Education 2005 and its implementation in schools.

UK
(PISA 2012 - #20)

The 2001 Special Educational Needs & Disability Act states that: “...where parents want a mainstream education for their child everything possible should be done to provide it.” The UK also has a statutory framework for inclusion and a statutory guidance that provides practical advice on how to offer inclusive education for children with special needs in mainstream schools.

USA
(PISA 2012 - #28)

The Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (IDEA) is a federal law that ensures students with disabilities are provided with Free Appropriate Public Education (FAPE) tailored to their individual needs. It was previously known as the Education for All Handicapped Children Act (EHA) from 1975 to 1990. IDEA, together with the No Child Left Behind (NCLB) Act of 2001 entitles all students to be included in the general education classroom to the greatest extent possible.

China


---

18 http://www.irma-international.org/viewtitle/55460/
19 https://repository.nie.edu.sg/bitstream/10497/13722/1/APJE-31-2-143_a.pdf
Annex B – Views & suggestions from parents surveyed (verbatim quotes)

A. How can we improve inclusion in Singapore?

**Awareness / Education**

1. “The Singapore government has provided many facilities and health assistance for people with special needs but I feel that more public awareness needs to be generated (preferably starting from school) about the wide varieties of special needs as now most Singaporeans are only aware of people with visible physical disabilities, so they misjudge those with mild physical disabilities or mental disabilities. I do believe inclusiveness starts from awareness and after that there will be acceptance.”

2. “The general public needs to have more awareness and education about special needs children and their behaviour. Currently, the public does not know much and they do not know how to handle or interact with special children.”

3. “Singaporeans in general like others to perceive them as gracious people. So they won't vocally reject and object to share public spaces with special needs people. However, they will avoid engaging them because they do not know how to properly engage them. Public education through mass media using real-life role models interacting with special needs people will help promote awareness and knowledge.”

**Inclusive Education**

4. “I would love to see an inclusive educational system in Singapore. For example, in Hong Kong, they have schools that are bilingual and bicultural. Both hearing and deaf children attend school together and learn English and sign language together. What an amazing impact this will have on both the deaf and hearing children in the school. They will definitely learn from young to accept children with special needs and likewise, the deaf children will feel accepted from young. This is ideal.”
5. “MOE should look into building more inclusive schools, i.e. Pathlight School within each school.”

6. “Singapore has done well by providing early intervention centres but the waiting time is too long as there are not enough. Also, I hope mainstream schools would be more supportive of special needs kids. This would greatly help the kids to integrate with others, especially kids with mild special needs.”

7. “Inclusion in school results in greater inclusion in society. As children are exposed to peers with special needs from a young age, they tend to be more accepting and understanding.”

B. How can the law advance the interests of the special needs child?

Education
1. “All children, whether typical or special needs, have the right to education. There should be compulsory early intervention for special needs children and subsidies for private therapy.”

Protection
2. “For equality, that they have the same rights as other people for education, fair treatment and protection.”

Opportunities
3. “We need laws to prevent discrimination in employment, the abuse of authority and for wheelchair access in restaurants.”

4. “New laws should reflect inclusion in all aspects of life, like work and education.”

Access to Key Amenities
5. “Laws should make it clear that someone with ASD (autism spectrum disorder) can go anywhere they want. I was scolded 3 times for bringing my child to the library.”